**Appendix 2.Profiles of partner organisations**

***References may be found on Appendix 3 of this website.***

***(1)El Sistema (Fundación Musical Simón Bolivar),* Venezuela**

The network of youth orchestras now known as *El Sistema* was founded by the economics professor and harpsichordist, José Antonio Abreu, who established an experimental youth orchestra in Caracas early in 1975, reputedly on the basis of ’eleven young people trying out some pieces in a garage’ (Tunstall 2012: 59), which by November of the same year had however already won the Aberdeen international competition for youth orchestras. At the time Abreu was an MP in the centre-left administration of Carlos Andres Pérez; he quickly built on his success by getting the government to fund a system of *núcleos* (local orchestral training centres for young people) based on the improvised prototype he had designed in Caracas. From the start it was a basic principle that access to training in a *núcleo* is free and open to all and that no child wishing to play in a training orchestra is ever turned away.

During the second Andrés Pérez administration (1989-93) Abreu, now a government minister, was able to get the contractual funding for FESNOJIV (*Federación del Estado para el Sistema Nacional de Orquestas Juveniles y Infantiles de Venezuela*, as it was then known), transferred from the Ministry of Finance to the Ministry of Youth Development, establishing the *Sistema* as the centrepiece of the government’s youth arts education framework and sidelining the existing state schools and conservatoires[[1]](#footnote-1). It was at this time that a commitment was made by the government to establish a system of infants’ and youth orchestras and choirs in every region of Venezuela, with the national youth orchestras, headed by the Simón Bolivar Youth Orchestra (SBYO), at its apex, and indeed at this time that the expression *El Sistema* came to be informally used to describe Abreu’s project. During the following decade the SBYO, under its new chief conductor Gustavo Dudamel, embarked on international concert tours which were a massive success, not only with audiences but with musicians such as Eduardo Mata, Claudio Abbado and Simon Rattle, who identified Venezuela as the place where ‘the most important work in music, anywhere, [was currently] being done’ (Arvelo 2006)

At the same time, especially since the late 1990s when the administration of Hugo Chávez (1998-2013) sought to reinforce its hold on power by aiming social programmes at the lower-middle classes, the *Sistema* actively sought to recruit members of its orchestras from the poorest shantytowns, apartment blocks and rural smallholdings, and eventually also to organise musical performances for special-needs groups, including prisoners since 2002, blind and physically handicapped children since 2004, terminally ill children since 2007 and since 2013, experimentally, expectant mothers to whom selected musical excerpts are played *in utero.* One commentator, Osvaldo García, has identified El Sistema as ‘the most successful social programme achieved by Venezuela in its 51 years of democratic governance’ (Garcia, Osvaldo Burgos(2009) *El Eco de la Orquesta….* Thesis for PhD in Communication and Music, University of Malaga, p9). International financial institutions such as the IDB, UNICEF and CAF, eager to support innovative ideas in the educational sector, began to fund El Sistema, and to relieve it of some of its dependence on government funding; and the Sistema began to be widely replicated and adapted internationally. At the time of writing, the *Fundación Musical Simón Bolivar* believes that its model, or adaptations of it, are in use in some 33 countries, more or less evenly divided between industrialised and developing countries (our interviews, Simón Bolivar Musical Foundation, September 2014), and in the United States alone it is believed that replications of *El Sistema* exist in over 30 states (Tunstall, 2012). Like microfinance, it therefore represents one of the rare cases of South-to-North technical transfer.

However, a crisis for *El Sistema* arose after Chávez’ death in 2013. His successor, Nicolás Maduro, lacking both Chávez’ popular charisma and his ability to hold the support of many in his own party, cracked down on popular protest against what had become an atmosphere of hyperinflation and economic collapse. The celebrated Venezuelan pianist, Gabriela Montero, wrote Dudamel an open letter in mid-2015 urging him to speak out against the regime, and then publicly attacked him when he failed to reply (*The Los Angeles Times,* 29 May 2015, http://www.latimes.com/entertainment/arts/classical ). At the same time, the English academic Geoffrey Baker (2014) has accused El Sistema’s teaching model of being unprogressive, authoritarian and out-of-date[[2]](#footnote-2). In mid-2017, the Venezuelan political crisis deepened, when Maduro suspended the newly-elected constitutional assembly, and in effect democracy in Venezuela came to an end. During street fighting in Caracas in the summer of 2017, many El Sistema members went on to the barricades, and one of them, the violist Armando Cañizales, was killed. Under this stress, Dudamel publicly accused Maduro of taking a wrong turning, and urged him to end the violence; Maduro publicly called Dudamel a traitor, ordered him to cancel a planned overseas concert tour, and since then has banned him from conducting the Simόn Bolivar Youth Orchestra(SBYO) overseas. At the time of writing, the situation remains unresolved. The economy is experiencing hyperinflation: for many, everyday life is a struggle to survive (Daniels and Ramirez, 2018), and many have migrated to Colombia and other neighbouring countries. Against this predicament, the government has sought to protect El Sistema and other favoured clients by paying its employees partly in dollars and partly in kind, including foodstuffs. In April 2018, following Abreu’s death the previous month, the Sistema has been placed under the direct control of the Office of the President, and three members of Venezuela’s Constitutional Assembly have been appointed to its board. Maduro has claimed victory in a disputed election, with *El Sistema* insisting that it is still growing and has reached its target of a million participants, but many members of the SBYO are reported to have left (Baker 2018).

***(2)Orchestre Symphonique Kimbanguiste* (OSK), Kinshasa, Democratic Republic of the Congo (DRC)**

Longbefore the advent of state sponsorship for the arts in the twentieth century, there is an honourable tradition of arts-related activities with a charitable purpose being sponsored by third-sector institutions, notably churches. Important examples of this include the *Ospedale della Pietá,* the choir of orphaned and abandoned girls for which Vivaldi, between 1723 and 1740, wrote much of his music; but also the choirs and other musical ensembles run, since the 1930s at least, by the Kimbanguiste church in the Democratic Republic of the Congo (DRC).

Initially the Kimbanguiste church, a radical-nationalist church founded in 1921 by Simon Kimbangu in support of the country’s nascent independence movement, supported a network of choirs and instrumental ensembles, and also a network of schools and hospitals. To these activities, in 1994, was added the *Orchestre Symphonique Kimbanguiste* (OSK), established in that year by Armand Diangienda, Simon Kimbangu’s grandson, a former airline pilot and part-time church musician. Until 2009 the OSK also was funded by the Kimbanguiste church, but since that date it has also earned income from private and corporate donations, and latterly from concert tours in California, Europe and elsewhere; but it will be clear that the social support and youth education functions of the OSK are discharged in a very different way from El Sistema in Venezuela, the state in this case being virtually off-stage and in particular, unlike the Venezuelan case, not a provider of public musical education on any significant scale. Not only this, but the DRC, with a per capita income of $150 in 2017, is the poorest country in the world, and by contrast with Venezuela the OSK, at the time of its foundation, lacked not only musical instruments, but clean water, a reliable electricity system, and a functioning state education system.

In spite of this, in June 2009, a public, open-air performance of Beethoven’s Ninth Symphony was somehow put on, *con brio,* on a football pitch in the middle of Kinshasa. The concert, and the extraordinary improvisations required to make it possible, were recorded and put on a DVD now available internationally (C. Wischmann and M. Baer: *Kinshasa Symphony,* C Major Entertainment, Berlin, 2010). As the movie illustrates, the orchestra’s guitarist had put himself in charge of making available the ten double-basses required to perform the symphony: since at the time there was only one functioning double-bass in the whole of Kinshasa, he took that apart and from this exercise learned enough to be able to be able to assemble most of the other nine (some were bought from abroad when international aid money became available) from the ample supplies of suitable wood available locally. This miraculous ingenuity, together with the endurance required to keep the players going through rehearsals after a full day’s work, are the hallmarks of the film, which helped to make the orchestra’s reputation and proved to be a turning-point in its fortunes, both international and domestic. The audience for that concert was about 50/50 Congolese and expatriates, but has since evolved to be mainly Congolese (Armand Diangienda, private communication).

In 2014, the OSK undertook a concert tour of England and Wales sponsored by the Arts Council. In London (Royal Festival Hall), Bristol, Manchester and Cardiff, the orchestra put on concerts jointly with local orchestras (the Hallé, the National Youth Orchestra and the BBC National Orchestra of Wales) in which Diangienda conducted Beethoven 9 or excerpts from it were played alongside pieces by Congolese composers; impromptu performances were also put on by members of the OSK jointly with local schools in each of the four locations, and the Hallé also provided technical assistance in the shape of instrument repair workshops. All of this marked an important stage in the orchestra’s globalisation, and the OSK seemed set at the time for the kind of eruption onto a world stage that has occurred with Sistema Venezuela. To date this has not happened, partly on account of the DRC’s currently chaotic political environment, but a programme of external concerts in France, Germany and the United States has continued to take place.

***(3)Il Sistema delle orchestre e dei Cori Giovanili ed infantili in Italia*, Italy**

**Overview**

In Italy, poverty is a significant and growing problem: unemployment is on the increase, and children raised in poverty today will grow up in circumstances which offers them a small-to-negligible, chance of improving their standard of living[[3]](#footnote-3). The weight of evidence from both experimental and non-experimental studies and research that attempt to isolate the impact on children’s well-being of growing up in low-income families, suggests that increases in income for poor families are causally (positively) related to children’s outcomes.

In 2010, thanks to the stimulus of Maestro Claudio Abbado — an enthusiastic supporter of the Venezuelan project since 1999 - *El Sistema* was established in Italy, where it is known as “Il Sistema delle Orchestre e dei Cori giovanili e Infantili in Italia (Onlus)”. Currently, there are more than 70 *nuclei* in the Il Sistema national programme. Although deriving from the original Venezuelan model, a number of regional variations on this original theme can be distinguished: according to the very diverse regional contexts, the focus may be directed to widespread in-school training (e.g., the Alto Adige/South Tyrol region), to the involvement of children as ambassadors of peace (*Pequeñas Huellas* in Piedmont), to a full-fledged, established music school renewing its course (Fiesole in Tuscany), to expanding youth ensembles (Emilia-Romagna), to pilot projects for the disadvantaged (the southern regions and a number of immigration-laden communities), or to productions aiming for higher artistic results, as in the previously mentioned pyramid of increasingly proficient ensembles, with exposure that rewards musical excellence[[4]](#footnote-4). The Italian Sistema is also financed much more by private institutions than not only the Venezuelan Sistema, but also all the study institutions in our sample, which are principally government- or NGO-financed.

From 2010 to 2018, the Italian network of regional initiatives was expanding: the 15 nuclei established by the end of 2010 had grown to 72, in the locations illustrated in Figure 1, at the time of writing in June 2017.

Fig. 1 Implementing the Italian network



In Italy, as in Venezuela, most activities are held in the *nuclei*, and the main activity is the children's orchestras. In addition, special educational projects for children with disabilities are in place; in particular, deaf children can "sing" along with the other young musicians by moving gloved hands (*Coro Manos Blancas*). The fundamental objective is to fight educational poverty by using music education to build children’s personal confidence and self-worth, and to harness tolerance, dialogue and togetherness in communities, with a strong focus on the disadvantaged, and refugees in particular.

***Il Sistema delle orchestre e dei Cori giovanili ed infantili in Italia* and community music**

Like *El Sistema* of Venezuela, therefore (described in our opening case study), the Italian *Sistema* has its roots both in classical and local folk musics; is committed to social inclusion; works with a decentralised ‘nucleo’ model as described above; and sees the harmonisation of individual talents within an orchestra as being a crucial part of the educational process.

However, the Italian *Sistema* has also developed distinctive features. One of these, as described above, is differentiation of function and process by region. But another is a greater willingness to embrace the community music tradition, conceived as ‘an approach to active music making and musical knowing *outside* of formal teaching and learning situations…involving skilled music leaders who facilitate group music-making experiences in environments that do not have set curricula’[[5]](#footnote-5). Reflecting this approach, in our research findings[[6]](#footnote-6), community, multiculturalism and informality recur frequently as important factors in the more than 70 *nuclei* interviewed, of which 78% say they use a multi-music group practice through professional choirs and orchestras (that is are active not only in formal musical education, but also are committed to the promotion of diversity and inclusion through non-formal methods, and also pursue musical education through non-formal musics, including rock music as well as classical and folk music, and improvisation as well as performance with a score. In our survey of *Il Sistema* (for further detail see Coppi, *Community Music*, chapters 12 and 13) approximately 58% of the Italian *nuclei* professed to be committed to "other strategies" of educational and relational interventions in the context of prevention, education and recovery, aimed at different stages of life (childhood, adolescence, youth) with special emphasis on the migration process of individuals and immigrant communities. In this dimension, we must not forget that a child coming from a family of immigrants with a long tenure is more involved in the kinds of relationships that directly affect the dynamics of acceptance and rejection, of integration and assimilation, the recognition and disavowal, equality and diversity.

In many pedagogical dimensions, as illustrated by Antonella Coppi, the *Il Sistema* Italian model can be seen as a fusion between the model established by Sistema Venezuela and the community music tradition, as shown in Figure 2:

**Figure 2.Community Music and El Sistema**

**Learning through Performing;**

**participants play in front of audiences as much as possible. This reduces the pressure of formal performance, and allows performing to become a natural part of their musical life.**

**Cooperative Learning, Peer Education approach, transformative Learning, Lifelong Learning,**

**Create a daily haven of safety, joy and fun that builds every child’s self-esteem and sense of value.**

**Inclusion and Integration**

**Building a Community**

**Music Making**

**«Free Music for Everyone»**

This contrast between the Italian (community music-influenced) *Sistema* and its Venezuelan forebear can be taken further, in two respects. One is in its emphasis on empowerment, a concept which has now made its way into the Italian language. Empowerment, which is defined as "to feel able to do something”, is a process as seen from the point of view of whoever is engaged in it. Our research data analysis shows that the Italian *Sistema* is strongly oriented to the founding principles of the concept of system and connectivity: which means being able to change the social context, making it more attractive, open and inclusive, democratic, free and legal, and linked to knowledge necessary for learning. In this regard, Community Music approaches and activities constitute a fundamental step towards the development of these pedagogical goals.

This approach is closely related to the ‘capability approach’ developed by the Nobel-winning economist Amartya Sen. Sen’s capability approach[[7]](#footnote-7) is defined by its focus upon the moral significance of individuals’ capability of achieving the kind of lives they have reason to value. This distinguishes it from more established approaches to ethical evaluation, such as utilitarianism or resourcism, which focus exclusively on subjective well-being or the availability of means to achieve the good life, respectively. A person’s capability to live a good life is defined in terms of the set of valuable ‘beings and doings’ like being in good health or having loving relationships with others to which they have real access[[8]](#footnote-8) (Wells, 2013).The capability approach can be transferred in an educational context: the heart of the notion of a capability is a conception that a person is able to develop a reasoned understanding of the value of beings and doings. This in itself is a powerful argument for forms of education through which an individual can explore her own conception of what it is she has reason to value. If an important normative goal is capability expansion, then developing education is a part of expanding the capacity to make valued choices in other spheres of life. We use this approach, and this concept of well-being, as the basis for our analytical work on the organisations listed here (see the topic guide for this project, also on this website).

Seeing education as linked to expanding learning and valued choices entails an evaluation of education that goes considerably beyond those based solely on outcome measures, such as numbers enrolled, test scores, or income. These indicators tend to aim at maximising specific educational outcomes (or ‘achieved functionings’ relating to education) but do not provide a means to evaluate the overall purpose of education in relation to human well-being. The nuclei of the *Italian Sistema* constitute a model in which the development of a personal identity takes place simultaneously with musical learning, both aimed at the pursuit of the social purpose of growing up, learning to lead a life of dignity, joy and empowerment.

**Summary**

*Il Sistema delle Orchestre e dei Cori Giovanili ed Infantili in Italia* is an organization that strives to bring high quality music education to underrepresented communities. Their mission has spread across the country during a time when arts funding is being cut at the state and regional levels. The *Sistema’*s openness to a multitude of teaching styles offers its students access to different learning experiences. However, the lack of pedagogical unity has raised some concern in the Il Sistema community about its unique identity as a music organization.

Recent studies have reviewed the challenges of cooperative projects between schools and other institutions, people, parents, children, and teachers, with a positive undercurrent showing that pedagogical approaches follow the principles of music making being used for social change and building bridges in a multicultural setting. Music can connect people across cultures, continents and religious beliefs. Music can bridge gaps between socio-economic classes and age groups, and can reach a variety of populations that are underserved. The current world approach to education is having a dangerously strong (and limiting) commitment to a culture of competition and authority. For this matter, all arts educators have to lead the way to a new world of pedagogies which embrace transformation and sustainability, diversity and inclusivity. In this way, music as a practical tool for dialogue among people must be used to enhance and promote solutions for social and economic challenges. The power of music is immeasurable and filled with endless possibilities.[[9]](#footnote-9) And we should be grateful to many teachers and people that trust in it and work to concretely offer music projects that are life-changing. The El Sistema Model and the Community Music approach are only two examples: there are numerous other successful projects in over 40 countries worldwide that offer great opportunities and reinforce the practical beneficial force of music in areas such as sustainable community development, mental and physical health, healing trauma survivors from both man-made and natural events, enhancing learning, and promoting well-being and peacebuilding. Moreover, there are many opportunities inherent in using music together with information and communications technologies (ICT) in order to provide meaningful solutions to our social and economic challenges. The creative energy and expertise of the public and private sectors has to be brought together so that music can enhance the lives of people everywhere, offering them opportunities to meet and mingle in an environment where the rule of law and social inclusion are inalienable rights.

**(4)More Music, Morecambe, UK**

More Music was founded in 1993 by Pete Moser, who continued to direct it until his retirement in 2017. Formally it is a private limited company, but it is also a social enterprise, deliberately located in the West End of Morecambe, one of the poorest neighbourhoods of Northern England[[10]](#footnote-10), and pursuing a range of highly creative, multi-media social protection activities focussed often on local ethnic minority communities: the South Asians of Burnley, the Poles of West Morecambe and, the most spectacular, the Long Walk and Kite Festival organised on the sands of Morecambe in honour of the Chinese community, which was shocked in 2009 by the deaths of twenty cockle-pickers caught by a suddenly rising tide. It describes its objective as being ‘to build confidence and spirit in individuals and communities through the arts, especially music’. In 2017, More Music employed 22 employees and had a turnover of £850,000.

Two reports commissioned by More Music in 2013/14 (Ainsley (2013)and Silva and Liang (2014)) tell us something about the market which More Music is serving. It provides, typically, jazz, folk, and world music to two sharply distinct audiences – a low-income, typically white male, catchment within West Morecambe and a much higher-income, more footloose and in every way more diverse audience that migrates in from places as distant as Carlisle, Bradford and the Potteries (Ainsley 2013: 29 and Silva and Liang 2014: 24). These two contrasted populations illustrate contrasted aspects of Morecambe’s persona – a depressed high-unemployment area but also a scenic place by the sea to which people come from far and wide to be entertained. Astute choice of location has enabled More Music to reconcile high social impact with a fast-growing market, focussed on the young (and principally sponsored by the government funder Youth Music) but open to all ages. However, in Pete Moser’s judgment, other qualities have been required to enable More Music to grow. In a paper prepared for the Community Music Association in 2010, he characterised the requirements of a successful community music organisation as ‘access, imagination, continuity and community’ (Moser 2010: 10), and continuity ( a commitment to long-term development and thus building trust) and creative imagination are probably every bit as important as the other two requirements of success mentioned above.

**(5)SoundLincs, Lincoln, UK**

SoundLincs originated in 1998, from a request by Lincolnshire County Council to the cellist Nikki-Kate Heyes to establish a music service for the whole of Lincolnshire. Antonella Coppi has characterised Nikki-Kate’s approach to music teaching as follows:

[She insists] that passion is an essential personal quality, necessary to achieve an effective group performance. Beyond this, Nikki-Kate practises empathy, to achieve connectivity with participants and support their imagination and creativity (Coppi, *Community Music: Nuovi orientamenti pedagogici*, p.71]

The group around Nikki-Kate who established this service have now become, like More Music, a private limited liability company, and like More Music, Sound Lincs operates not with training orchestras à la Sistema Venezuela and Italia but with small, flexible performer ensembles mainly at the popular/world music end of the musical spectrum. However, SoundLincs is distinguished from More Music both by its greater dependence on local authority contracts, and by its characteristic mode of operation, which is to take the music to the customer(s), rather than the customers coming, as with More Music and all the other organisations in our ‘team’, to a central point which provides the focus for musical performance, musical training and social interaction. Community-building, although an important objective of Sound Lincs, is thus pursued in a different way from in the other organisations listed here. Sound Lincs’ social services are also more oriented towards younger children, through its contributions to early-years education and the support of children at risk, than those of More Music; but also encompass support for youth justice services, hospitals, young parents, special education, and isolated rural people including, latterly, migrant workers. The organisation now has 8 employees and a turnover of £361,000.

SoundLINCS’ vision is that everyone has an opportunity to be empowered through music, working from early-years education through to older adults and supporting children and young people in challenging circumstances, including youth justice services, hospitals, young parents, special education needs and disabilities, including deafness, and people affected by rural isolation.

Recent research has involved discussion and activity with:

* Bishop Grosseteste University - Music programmes for Early Years and vulnerable young parents.
* Nottingham Trent University - Music programmes for whole class teaching in SEND settings and young people who offend or are at risk of offending.
* York St John University - Workforce development programme with Children’s Services practitioners.
* University of Lincoln - Music programme in two paediatric wards of a county hospital
* University of Leeds - Toolkit for music work with deaf/hearing impaired

soundLINCS instigates research activity to make a difference in the ways that inclusive musical practice is perceived, adopted, and enacted within the original partnerships and subsequently transferred to new or related contexts. Their visible legacy emerges through compelling documents, useful toolkits, resource apps, improved practice and sustained change within musical and non-musical organisations.

1. Abreu supported his case by arguing that playing in an orchestra created a culture of mutual dependence and mutual support which encouraged the development of social skills, and thence citizenship and employability (see Arvelo 2006) [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. This view is contested. Simon Rattle (in Alberto Arvelo’s 2006 DVD, *Tocar y Luchar*), insists that in the Sistema ‘there is no culture of criticism but rather of encouragement – if you make a mistake, people laugh and say “it will be better next time” ‘. [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. A.Coppi, *Community Music: nuovi orientamenti pedagogici*, Milano: FrancoAngeli 2017, ch.9. [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. M. Majno, ‘From the model of El Sistema in Venezuela to current applications: learning and integration through collective music education’, *Annals of the New York Academy of Sciences,* 1252:1, 56-64. [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
5. Lee Higgins, *Community Music in Theory and Practice,* Oxford; Oxford University Press 2012, p.4 [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
6. Antonella Coppi, *Community Music: nuovi orientamenti pedagogici*, Milano: FrancoAngeli 2017, fig.12,p.210. [↑](#footnote-ref-6)
7. See A.K. Sen, *Commodities and Capabilities*(Amsterdam: North-Holland, 1985); A.K. Sen and Martha Nussbaum(eds) *The Quality of Life* (Oxford, Clarendon Press, 1993) and A.K. Sen, *The idea of justice,* (London: Allen Lane, 2009) [↑](#footnote-ref-7)
8. T. Wells, *Sen’s Capability Approach,* Internet Encyclopedia of Philosophy. [↑](#footnote-ref-8)
9. Dr. Yeou-Cheng Ma, Assistant Professor-Clinical Pediatrics, Albert Einstein College of

   Medicine . Executive Director of Children Orchestras Project, personal communication. [↑](#footnote-ref-9)
10. More Music is in Harbour ward, Morecambe and in IMD (index of multiple deprivation) area Lancaster 009A. Its IMD ranking is 106 out of 32,844, i.e. it is in the poorest 1% of English neighbourhoods by level of multiple deprivation (a composite measure combining income, health, education, unemployment, environmental quality, crime, and other measures of well-being). [↑](#footnote-ref-10)