How concerned are you about the following ethical issues as they relate to AI in learning?



Responsible AI and Learning

Professor Christopher Bennett

History, Philosophy and Digital Humanities

University of Sheffield

In this talk ...

- I look at the idea of Responsible AI and how it might apply to learning
- The basic themes I consider are protecting the basic aims of education and preventing downstream harms
- I look briefly at how these might apply to **five** issues about AI and learning

What is responsible AI?

- 1. Responsibilities (obligations)
- 2. Holding to account/sanctioning
- 3. Responsible usage/approach
- How to give content to these themes in the context of university education?

Responsible AI in education

- What are the responsibilities of students, teachers and policymakers in relation to AI?
- To what extent is it important to be able to hold the relevant parties to account regarding their (mis-)use of AI?
- What is responsible usage of AI in university education?

Responsible usage/approach – by whom?

- Students
- Teachers
- Legislators/policy makers

Responsible usage/approach – why?

- Given the basic point or aims of (university) education, is some AI good and some bad?
- I.e., some AI usage is beneficial to those aims and some detrimental?
- N.B., there are different understandings of 'the basic point of education' from narrower, professional skills-based models, to broader, humanistic self-development models
- Can AI produce downstream harms that we should take steps to avoid?
- If it's not all beneficial, in what ways would it be desirable for AI usage to be constrained, and how could we do that?

Fair opportunities for achievement

- In part, education is about giving students genuine and fair opportunities for the development and testing of skills
- So, we need an environment that does not privilege already advantaged students
- And that makes it possible to distinguish a student who has those skills from one who does not.
- So, we need fair access to technology
- And we need to be able to distinguish plagiarism from independent work. But can we?
- (Which skills? AI skills? Interesting, but discipline-based skills are not going to be fully replaced by AI skills)

Plagiarism

- Does it matter if we can't detect plagiarism?
- It has never been possible comprehensively to pick up on use of e.g. essay mills.
- What do we do? Ask students to sign a declaration.
- Is that pointless?
- Not necessarily: expressive; transfers responsibility to student; may have some deterrent effect.

The conversational model of academic inquiry

- One way of seeing university education is as bringing students into an ongoing conversation that takes place in academic disciplines
- But we need to keep up the quality of the conversation
- Some usage of AI would threaten the possibility of innovation it may lead to the endless recycling of the conversation
- Reproducing biases that lead to social injustice

Unintended but foreseeable harms

- Sometimes unconstrained use of available resources is fine the happy libertarian
- But not always
- Others have claims e.g. water supply downstream harms and finite resources
- Environmental impact/sustainability of AI technologies
- Reinforcement of injustices that are legacy of colonialism

Human interaction

- In very basic ways, we prize interactions in which one person pays attention to another
- Recognition or mutual recognition
- Education as we understand it is not just a process of filling people with information and skills
- It is also a human interaction, and may owe some of its value and effectiveness to that
- How to retain the human-interactive aspect of education given the increasing reliance on AI?

AI & Learning

Jutta Haider

Swedish School of Library and Information Science (SSLIS | University of Borås)



Which are the most critical ethical aspects of AI in learning?

What are the counterbalancing ethical benefits?

What is responsible AI in learning?



De-skilling

What is it that is being automated and datafied?

Accountability

How can society and how can individuals retain control?

Refusal

What mechanisms for refusal are there and which ones do we need?



High-reach AI & function creep

at the national level, most of the transparency provisions pertinent to VLOPs are already in effect.

The widespread societal adoption of such AI technologies as social media recommender systems can be seen as the defining feature of *high-reach* AI. These broadly used data-driven AI systems have been shown to carry the potential to pose substantial risks for individual users *over time*, as well as *in aggregation* in a way that can exert urgent threats on societies. Examples of high-reach AI include any AI technology used on a large scale, such as music and film suggestions, personalised ads, search engine rankings, and other popular AI technologies like generative AI (ACM, 2023; Lorenz et al., 2023) – that is, AI-models capable of generating texts, images and sounds based on mere prompts by human users.

The emergence of these high-reach AI phenomena clearly links to the digital organisation following from *platformisation* (van Dijck et al., 2018; Poell et al., 2019), often embedded in a particular type of commercial logic (Srnicek, 2017), with not only privacy implications but also antitrust in terms of a few's control over the many (Larsson et al., 2021). In practical terms, high-

Söderlund, K.et al (2024). Regulating high-reach AI: On transparency directions in the Digital Services Act. Internet Policy Review, 13(1). https://doi.org/10.14763/2024.1.1746



💄 You

tell me about "climate: the movie"

Copilot

"Climate: The Movie" is a documentary film that presents a different pe Here are some key details about the movie:

- · Director and Writer: The film is written and directed by Martin Durki
- · Producer: The producer of the film is climate podcaster Tom Nelsor
- Content: The movie challenges the mainstream narrative of a clima features interviews with several prominent scientists who reject the alternative evidence from various sources a 4.
- Key Points: The film argues that the official global temperature recc and other biases, and that the current temperatures are not unprece and beneficial for life on Earth ⁽³⁾ ⁽⁴⁾.
- Political and Financial Motives: The movie also exposes the political alarm industry, and warns of the threat it poses to individual freedor
- IMDb Rating: The movie has an IMDb rating of 7.3/10 1.

Learn more 1 = imdb.com

6 v vimeo.com

The film is supported by scientists who have signed the Clintel's World researchers seeks to present an alternative narrative in the face of the available on platforms like YouTube (a) (4) (5) and Vimeo (6). Please not subject to debate

see less

2 Sclintel.org 3 voutube.com

🌍 Copilot

"Climate: The Movie" (also known as "The Cold Truth") is a documentary that presents an alternative perspective on the climate change debate 1. The film is supported by scientists who have signed the Clintel's World Climate Declaration 1.

The director of the movie, Martin Durkin, discusses how some scientists feel silenced if their findings don't fit the climate alarm narrative². He mentions that these scientists are not allowed to point to scientific data or observations published in mainstream journals, even if they're carried out by respected universities and cited by the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC), if it doesn't fit the narrative².

The movie highlights the pressure on scientists to conform to the dominant discourse on climate change and the extreme measures taken to silence those who present alternative data 2. It also discusses the emergence of alternative political movements and the shift in the debate among ordinary people 2.

The movie was released on 21st March 2024 on Youtube and other platforms². It has received a rating of 7.3/10 on IMDb¹. The film features interviews with several scientists and experts, providing a different perspective on the climate change debate¹.

Please note that this is a controversial topic and the movie represents one perspective. It's always a good idea to explore multiple sources and viewpoints when researching complex issues like climate change.

Learn more 1 = imdb.com 2 💠 telegraph.co.uk 3 🕲 dailydeclaration.org.au

New topic

(?) I appreciate the information. Are there any other documentaries on climate change? Thank you for sharing! What are some key arguments made in 'Climate: The Movie'? Interesting! How has this movie been received by audiences and critics?

Ask me anything...

3 0

- How does Copilot work?
- How is this different from a regular search engine?

Copilot builds on the existing Bing experience to provid

- Beyond generating a list of relevant links, Copilot co give you a single, summarized answer.
- Search in a way that feels natural to how you talk, tex searches and shares back a detailed response.
- In the Copilot experience, you can chat naturally and search to get detailed replies.
- When you open the Copilot experience on the Edge in reference to the specific webpage you are viewing
- Copilot can be used as a creative tool. It can help you for a project.
 - How does Copilot generate responses?

Copilot searches for relevant content across the web and then summarizes what it finds to generate a helpful response. It also cites its sources, so you're able to see links to the web content it references.

- https://www.microsoft.com/en-us/bing?ep=0&form=MA13LV&es=31
- https://blog.google/products/search/generative-ai-google-search-may-2024/

SEARCH

May 14, 2024

Liz Reid

5 min read

Generative AI in Search: Let Google do the searching for you

With expanded AI Overviews, more planning and research capabilities, and AI-organized search results, our custom Gemini model can take the legwork out of searching.



Q what are good options for a...

Images

All

News Videos

0

Pers

Shopping



Share

SEARCH

Al Overviews: About last week

Are Copilot's AI-generated responses

one donce obogie that question. Tou

May 30, 2024 · 4 min read



There isn't much web content that seriously contemplates that question, either. This is what is often called a "data void" or "information gap," where there's a limited amount of high quality content about a topic. However, in this case, there is satirical content on this topic ... that also happened to be republished on a geological software provider's website. So when someone put that question into Search, an Al Overview appeared that faithfully linked to one of the only websites that tackled the question.

In other examples, we saw ALOverviewe that featured eareastic or trall visentant from discussion



<u>https://www.microsoft.com/en-us/bing?ep=0&form=MA13LV&es=31</u>

<u>https://blog.google/products/search/ai-overviews-update-may-2024</u>

Questions:

- What are the skills that are being datafied/automated (AI) and how do we retain control?
- How can we prepare students for decisions on how, but also whether or not AI (and other types of datafication) is appropriate – for themselves, and for society/specific communities?
- How can responsibility be tied to accountability? Does a discussion on ethics suffice to ensure responsibility at the right level?



Solutions: Boundary Objects and **Heterogeneous Distributed Problem** HOME > SCIENCE > VOL. 381, NO. 6658 > WE NEED A WEIZENBAUM TEST FOR A Solving

EXPERT VOICES

X in 🕁

We need a Weizenbaum test for AI

JACK STILGOE D Authors Info & Affiliations

SCIENCE • 11 Aug 2023 • Vol 381, Issue 6658 • DOI: 10.1126/science.adk0176

➡ 16756 ■9 1

0

 \sim

Alan Turing introduced his 1950 paper on Computing Machinery and Intelligence with the question <u>"Can machines think?"</u> But rather than engaging in what he regarded as never-ending subjective debate about definitions of intelligence, he instead proposed a thought experiment. His "imitation game" offered a test in which an evaluator held conversations with a human and a computer. If the evaluator failed to tell them apart,

Weizenbaum's questions, though they seem simple—Is it good? Do we need it?—are difficult ones for computer science to answer. They could be asked of any proposed technology, but the speed, scope, and stakes of innovation in AI make their considera-

BIBLIOTEKSHOGSKOLAN

Susan Leigh Star

Abstract

The paper argues that the develo on a social metaphor, rather that by the "Durkheim Test," that i to meet community goals. Unde of due process in open systems. decision-making in a fair and flex cial intelligence. From analyses c the paper derives the concept of b be an appropriate data structure f

After the discussion... how concerned are you about the following ethical issues as they relate to AI in learning?

